(5) 30th Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Union Excise Duties-Price Lists.

(6) 36th Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Refunds of Central Excise Duties.

(7) 73rd Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Family Welfare Programme.

(8) 80th Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Union Excise Duties-Non Vacation of Stay Orders from the Court.

(9) 94th Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Disinvestment of Government shareholding in selected Public Sector Enterprises during 1991-92.

(10) 119th Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Drawback of Duties-Fraudelent Drawback.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, this matter in regard to the Women's Bill—where Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan and others want the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to come was raised in the morning, just at the start of the Question Hour. I will call the Parliamentary Affairs Minister and get the whole thing cleared. Then we will come back to the House and let you know what the position is. There is still one week left for the Session to end. We will find out from the Government.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA (Karnataka): Madam, we have been refused time this week in the Business Advisory Committee.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will be going to the Business Advisory Committee. We will discuss this matter. It is not only a question of the Bill being introduced. There are other questions also which have to be taken into account. There are certain recommendations made by the Joint Parliamentary Committee which considered this Bill. There are certain recommendations. They have to go to the Cabinet. There is very little time. They should immediately go to the Cabinet and come back. These two-three things are there.

Now, the Home Minister wants to say a few things. Mr. Home Minister, Prof. Soz and Mr. Salim want to make their submissions on the same matter. I think it will be better if they raise it first and then you react to it.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Will that be better?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think so. It is about the Amarnath Yatra tragedy; the same thing. They have taken permission.

RE. AMARNATH YATRA TRAGEDY

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ (Jammu and Kashmir): Madam, with your permission, I rise to express my deepest anguish over the tragedy that occurred on 21st August this year en route Amarnath in which many yatris lost their lives. Becuase I was not here at that time, I could not...

उपसभापति: शायद आपका माइक नहीं चल रहा है।

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Sorry, it was not on.

Since I was not here at that time, I could not join you to express my deepest anguish over the tragedy that occurred in August en route to Amarnath. For this expression the occasion today is that the Home Ministry had constituted a committee—the Dr. Nitish Sengupta Committee-to look into all aspects of the tragedy. That Committee's report has been received by the hon. Home Minister, but something has happened meanwhile and it is nothing new to his Ministry—it happens with all the Ministries. It happened earlier also; I saw it for more than 15 years that even before the reports come to Parliament, they are leaked out. I think, the Hindustan Times carried, in two issues, a kind of synopsis of this report. I would request the hon. Home Minister to see, for future, that such reports should come before both the Houses of Parliament before they go to the press.

But the issue that I am raising, Madam, is that so many things have been said by the Dr. Nitish Sengupta Committee. I have seen this report. It is very brief, and when it comes we should discuss it. There are so many good suggestions for future. It was a man-made tragedy which could have been avoided. I am not going into the aspect as to who should be punished. There are some remarks about the Governor, and I am not going into that aspect also. I am coming to a positive aspect. But, before that, I must say that so many people joined the yatra because of coaxing by a political party. I do not want to create an atmosphere of rancour here, but the yatris said it at that time in Pahalgam and it is known to this Committee.

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, it is not fair to say that people had participated in the yatra because of a political party. ..(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I have not named the party. With a full sense of responsibility I am saying this. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI: For thousands of years people have been going for the Amarnath yatra. ..(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Even before I said something, you are rising on your feet. I will not attribute any motive. This is not something...

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: मैडम, अमरनाथ की यात्रा पर उस जमाने से लोग जा रहे हैं जब पोलिटिकल पार्टी का कोई सवाल ही नहीं था (**व्यवधान**)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I would crave the indulgence of this august House to listen to me very patiently. ..(*Interruptions*)... I would crave the indulgence of the House to listen to me very patiently. ..(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. If there is anything objectionable or hurting anyone, I will take care of it. As long as it is about good suggestions for the safety and security of the yatris and how the number of yatris has increased year after year, the Government also has to make certain arrangements considering the number of the people...(*Interruptions*)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: And the report is available here. We should discuss it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: हमें कोई एतराज नहीं है। मुझे एतराज तो यह है कि जब यह कहा जाता है कि पोलिटिकल पार्टीज की वजह से नम्बर बढ़ रहा है, यह कहना गलत है (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति: अभी आप सुनने दीजिये। (**व्यवधान**) अच्छी बात है, अगर वह गलत कहेंगे तो

I will take care of anything which is objectionable. If anybody says anything objectionable, I will definitely take care of it.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: There is ample evidence. In Pahalgam some of the yatris said it—there is evidence—and there are FIRs in the thanas. Some yatris had said that they paid only one rupee for the whole trip because all the funding was provided by certain outfits. I am not going into that question also. ...(*Interruptions*)... But I am saying this for future. So we should not create a situation...

...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन (उत्तर प्रदेश): अभी आपने राजनीतिक दल की बात कही ...(**व्यवधान**)

श्री राघवजी (मध्य प्रदेश): यह क्या हो रहा है? (**व्यवधान**)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: They have no reason to rise on their feet before I finish. ...(*Interruptions*)... Before I finish you should not rise on your feet. ...(*Interruptions*)... They have no reason to rise on their feet. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have not finished. ...(*Interruptions*)... I am commenting on the Dr. Nitish Sengupta Committee report. So many people were sent...

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: यात्री तफरीह के लिए नहीं जाते हैं (**व्यवधान**) श्रीनगर तफरीह के लिए जाते हैं। होम मिनिस्टर ने कहा था कि वहां नहीं जाएं (**व्यवधान**) अमरनाथ यात्रा पर जाते हैं, इसमें राजनीति लाने का कोई प्रश्न नहीं है (**व्यवधान**)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Whether they want ...(*Interruptions*)... You cannot join issue before I finish. ...(*Interruptions*)... Madam ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: ट्रेजेडी की जो रिपार्ट डिसकस हो रही है उसका राजनीतिकरण कर रहे हैं

उपसभापति: आप बैठिए। सवाल यह नहीं है .. (**व्यवधान**) बैठिए एक मिनट..

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): Their interruptions are not fair.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, I am going to speak on a very important aspect. I request the hon. Home Minister kindly to yield to me becuase I have not finished.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA): Madam, with due respect, I thing, it would be more appropriate for Prof. Soz or any other Member to comment on the reported comments of the inquiry committee.... (*Interruptions*)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Certainly. I am doing that

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One second.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Now let him finish the announcement that he wanted to make.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I will do that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. The Home Minister is speaking.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: The report is now in the process of being translated into Hindi. As soon as that is completed, it will be laid on the tables of both the Houses early next week. A full-fledged discussion can take place on it after that rather than commenting now on what may be only leakages and so on.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree.

Prof. Soz, I think, the Home Minister's suggestion is very good. ..(*Interruptions*)

Just one second, just one second.

आप एक मिनट तशरीफ रखेंगे।

Mr. Salim also wanted to say something because he had visited that place at that time. This permission has been granted. You come from Kashmir. You were not there when this very sad thing happened to the *yatris* over there, the first time perhpas in such a great magnitude. So, we were all very concerned about it. We discussed it on the Floor of the House in great detail, and at the end we insisted that the Home Ministry should have a committee. The Members insisted on it, and he did so. He visited that place, and all that happened.

Now the report has come. It is before the Home Minister. He has said, "It is going to be translated in Hindi also." When it is laid on the Table of the House, I would be only too happy to have a discussion on the Floor of the House. The question of acceptance by the Government of the suggestions made by the Committee is there. Members can make their suggestions also from the floor of the House. Your suggestions would also be appreciated because you come from that State, and you know the situation over there. It is not for the first time but it is for many years that *yatris* have been going to all the religious places in Jammu and Kashmir. I think, instead of making this a political issue ......

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I am not going into that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: ..... let us make it a human issue, a human tragedy. It was a human tragedy. We all feel sorry if it happens to *yatris* of Amarnath or to *yatris* at the *Nahan ka Mela* or *yatris* of the Haj or those anywhere else. Our sympathies are for the people who die, for whatever reason they may die, whether they die of a man-made calamity or a natural calamity.

I think, at that time we will discuss it, and will appreciate your concern.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: The Sen Gupta Committee has paid a tribute to the Kashmiris who came forward to offer relief and help.

श्री सुन्दर सिंह भंडारी (राजस्थान): कमेटी की रिपोर्ट पर डिसकशन होने दीजिए।

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I will just read a samll paragraph because that aspect has not been substantially highlighted here earlier. I saw the proceedings.

उपसभापति: मैंने बोला ना...(व्यवधान)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Therefore, I will read out a brief paragraph praising the role of the Kashmiri villagers.

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: कमेटी की रिपोर्ट आने दीजिए तब उस पर विचार कर लीजिएगा। गृह मंत्री महोदय ने स्पष्ट कहा है ...(व्यवधान) गृह मंत्री महोदय कह रहे हैं कि कमेटी की रिपोर्ट रख रहे हैं तब उस पर विचार कर लीजिएगा...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow a discussion on a report which is not in the possession of the House.

सोज साहब इसमें दो राय नहीं है ...(व्यवधान)

प्रो० सैफुद्दीन सोज: अच्छा, मगर मेरी एक बात सुनिए (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: आप बैठिए तो जरा। देखिए, सदियों से, जब से हम और आप पैदा नहीं हुए थे, तब से अमरनाथ की यात्रा पर लोग जाते हैं और अगर वहां के स्थानीय लोग, चाहे किसी भी धर्म को मानते हों, काश्मीर के लोग उनकी मदद नहीं कर रहे होते, उनकी सहायता, सहयोग नहीं कर रहे होते तो इतनी सदियों से लोग नहीं जा रहे होते और कुछ न कुछ वाकयात खराब रहते। इस चीज को कोई नहीं कह रहा है कि आप लोगों ने उनके साथ बुरा सुलूक किया। जब कमेटी की रिपोर्ट आएगी तो जो कुछ भी कमेटी ने कहा है वह सब हम यहां रिकार्ड पर लाएंगे पर एक तरीका होना चाहिए ...(**व्यवधान**)

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: जरा यह बात कहने दीजिए कि काश्मीरी लोगों ने वहां सहायता ही नहीं दी, सेनगुप्ता कमेटी में यह बात दर्ज है कि उन्होंने अपने मकानात भी दिए ...(**व्यवधान**) वार्म अप? का सामान दिया ... (**व्यवधान**) इनको इस पर गुस्सा नहीं आना चाहिए ...(**व्यवधान**) मस्जिदों के दरवाजे खोले। आप मेरी बात तो सुनिए ...(**व्यवधान**)

मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं उस मौके पर चूंकि बहुत गलतफहमी पैदा की गई इसलिए मैं यह कहता हूं कि इस अगस्त हाउस को कश्मीरियों के हक में ट्रिब्यूट करना चाहिए। ...(**व्यवधान**) I am not yielding. Madam, you have permitted me. (Interruptions) Kindly allow me to read only four lines from the report.

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: कितनी मदद वहां के बाशिंदों ने की ....(**व्यवधान**)

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: पहले आप मेरी बात सुनिए .... (**व्यवधान**) मैं कोई झगड़े की बात नहीं कर रहा हूं। .... (**व्यवधान**) मैं कोई कंट्रोवर्सी नहीं कर रहा हूं। ... (**व्यवधान**) मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं उस वक्त जो वहां... (**व्यवधान**)

विपक्ष के नेता श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, मैं आपकी तरफ से एक दरख्वास्त करूंगा ...(**व्यवधान**)

†[نیتا ورودھ دل "شری سکندر بخت" صدر صاحبہ - میں آپکی طرف سے ایک درخواست کرونگا - ..."مداخلت"...]

उपसभापति: एक सैकंड। ...(**व्यवधान**)

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: इनका क्या एतराज है यह तो रोशन ख्याल आदमी हैं। सिकन्दर साहब कहिए।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: देखिए, बदकिस्मती ऐसी है कि मैं सोज साहब का बहुत एहतराम करता हूं और मैं समझता हूं कि बहुत ही पालिशड पार्लियामेंट के साथियों में से वह हैं और राज्य सभा में पहली मर्तबा तशरीफ लाए हैं। लेकिन यह सवाल ऐसा है कि बशौक कहिए रिपोर्ट के आने के बाद कहिए बात लबो-लहजे में बहुत सारे पहलू ऐसे निकलते हैं कि दूसरे लोगों के जजबात मजरूह होते हैं। उसको हम एवोइड करें तो अच्छा है। ...(**व्यवधान**)

†[شری سکندر بخت : دیکھئے - بدقسمتی ایسی ہے کہ میں سوز صاحب کا بہت احترام کرتا ہوں اور میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ بہت ہی پالشڈ پارلیمنٹ کے ساتھیوں میں سے وہ ہیں - اور راجیہ سبھا میں پہلی مرتبہ تشریف لائے ہیں - لیکن یہ سوال ایسا ہے کہ باشوق کہئے رپورٹ کے آنے کے بعد کہئے بات لب و لہجے میں بہت سارے پہلو ایسے نکلتے ہیں کہ دوسرے لوگوں کے جذبات مجروح ہوتے ہیں اسکو ہم اوائڈ کریں تو اچھا ہے - ..."مداخلت"...]

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: मैंने कोई ऐसी बात नहीं कही है। ...(**व्यवधान**)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: मेरी बात तो खत्म हो जाए...(**व्यवधान**) बेचैनी नहीं, मैं खाली इतना कहना चाहता हूं कि होम मिनिस्टर के यह कहने के बाद कि वह यह आन् द फलोर ऑफ द हाउस रिपोर्ट रखने वाले हैं, उसके बाद इरशाद फरमा लीजिएगा, अच्छा है.. (**व्यवधान**) जरूरी है कि जितना आप कह चुके है उससे ज्यादा और कहना बाकी है। क्यों ख्वामखाह कहते हैं। मैं तो आपसे इतनी दरख्वास्त करूंगा कि आपने काफी कह दिया है, जितना कहना चाहिए था उतना काफी कह दिया। अब उसको आगे मत बढ़ाइये, वरना यह सिलसिला चलेगा। आपकी मर्जी है ...(**व्यवधान**)

†[شری سکندر بخت : میری بات تو ختم ہو جائے ..."مداخلت"... بے چینی نہیں میں خالی اتنا کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ ہوم منسٹر کے یہ کہنے کے بعد کہ وہ یہ "آن دی فلور آف دی ہاؤس" رپورٹ رکھنے والے ہیں - اسکے بعد ارشاد فرما لیجیئےگا اچھا ہے - ..."مداخلت"... ضروری ہے کہ جتنا آپ کہہ چکے ہیں اس سے زیادہ اور کہنا باقی

---

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script

ہے - کیوں خواہ مخواہ الجھتے ہیں - میں تو آپ سے اتنی درخواست کروں گا کہ آپنے کافی کہہ دیا ہے - اب اسکو آگے مت بڑھائیے ورنہ یہ سلسلہ چلیگا - آپکی مرضی ہے - ... مداخلت ...]

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज़: मैं कोई बड़ी कंट्रोवर्सी नहीं उठाना चाहता हूं लेकिन मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूं।...(व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: आपके हर लफज के साथ कंट्रोवर्सी खड़ी होती है।

†[شری سکندر بخت : آپکے ہر لفظ کے ساتھ کنٹروورسی کھڑی ہوتی ہے -]

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: नहीं, मैंने कोई कंट्रोवर्सी खड़ी नहीं की है।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: बड़ी बदकिस्मती है....(व्यवधान)

†[شری سکندر بخت : بڑی بدقسمتی ہے - ... مداخلت ...]

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: बड़े भाई, आप सुनिए,....(व्यवधान) मैं सिर्फ यह कहना चाहता हूं कि वहां जो एडवाइजर था यात्रा की ड्यूटी पर उसने वहां के कश्मीरी पुलिस अफसरों की बेइज्जती की, गाली दे दी, हालांकि उनका जुर्म यह था कि उन्होंने यात्रियों को हिफाजत से घरों में पहुंचा दिया था और उस वक्त जो एडवाइजर थे उन्होंने उनको इस काम के लिए गालियां दे दी..(व्यवधान) मैं यह कहना चाहता था कि कश्मीरियों का ह्यूमैनिज्म के लिए कमिटमैंट है। ...(व्यवधान) Kashmiris have a deeper commitment to secularism and humanism. The whole House should rise to pay a tribute to the people of Kashmir. (*Interruptions*) Why don't you rise to the occasion?

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI: Why should you not rise to the occasion before lecturing us? You are trying to raise an unnecessary controversy.

उपसभापति: आप बैठ जाइये। ....(व्यवधान)

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: चाहे कश्मीरी हो, चाहे हिन्दी हों, हम सब देश के लिए हैं।

उपसभापति: एक मिनट बैठिए।.....(व्यवधान) सोज साहब, एक मिनट बैठिए। ....(व्यवधान)

Soz Saheb, one second. (*Interruptions*) Will everybody keep quiet, please? The report is going to be placed on the Table of the House. A few days back Mr. John Fernandes raised the issue on the floor of the House saying that this Committee was constituted after a demand for it was made in Parliament. Report of any Committee which is constituted to enquire into an incident of a similar kind or any other kind should be laid on the Table of the House so that the Members can know what happened there. It would help them to suggest pre-emptive action the Government can take in future. I appreciate your concern as a member from Jammu and Kashmir. I appreciate the work or the support the Kashmiri people had given at that time, but let the report come. It is an inquiry committee report. When it is laid on the Table of the House, we will discuss it. This is for sure, but let the report be placed on the Table of the House. This is a matter of human tragedy for whatever reasons it was caused. At that time we will seriously consider all the points that the Committee raised.

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: मैंने कोई ऐसी बात नहीं की है। ..(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: ठीक है, मैंने भी अच्छी बात कह दी है। At least I have said a good thing.

Not only during Amar Nath yatra but even during Vaishnodevi yatra,—people belonging to another community carry *yatris* to the temple. They go there every time. There are not two opinions about it.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Let us preserve the tradition of humanism.

RE: NEED FOR A CENTRAL LEGISLATION FOR AGRICULTURAL WORKERS

श्री नगेन्द्र नाथ ओझा (बिहार): उपसभापति महोदया खेत मजदूरों के लिए केन्द्रीय कानून बनाने का आश्वासन इसी हाउस के अंदर लेबर मिनिस्टर ने पिछले सत्र में दिया था। यह सवाल पिछले सत्र के अंदर उठाया गया था और लेबर मिनिस्टर ने आश्वासन दिया था।

उपसभापति महोदया, उस सत्र के दौरान जब सरकार इस स्थिति में नहीं थी कि इस संबंध में बिल सदन में पेश करे तो भी उस ने लेबर मिनिस्टर के मार्फत यह स्टेटमेंट हाउस के अंदर दिया था कि यह लॉ डिपार्टमेंट में पेंडिंग है और शीघ्र वहां से उपाय कर के संबंधित बिल को तुरंत हाउस के अंदर पेश किया जाएगा। लेकिन इस सत्र के

---

†Transliteration in Arabic Script